THE HONORABLE TANYA L. THORP 1 Department 27 Note for Hearing: March 1, 2024 2 With Oral Argument 3 4 5 6 IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF WASHINGTON **COUNTY OF KING** 7 KARANBIR SINGH, HARPREET SINGH, and 8 NASTEHO OMAR, NO. 20-2-07084-0 SEA 9 Plaintiffs, **DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER** 10 IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ٧. ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS AND SERVICE 11 **AWARDS** IQ DATA INTERNATIONAL, INC., a Washington 12 for profit corporation, 13 Defendant. 14 15 I, Blythe H. Chandler, declare as follows: 16 17 Α. Background and experience. 18 I am a member of the law firm of Terrell Marshall Law Group PLLC (Terrell 19 Marshall), counsel of record for Plaintiffs in this matter. I am admitted to practice before this 20 Court and am a member in good standing of the bar of the state of Washington. I respectfully 21 submit this declaration in support of Plaintiff's Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs and Service 22 Awards. Except as otherwise noted, I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this 23 declaration and could testify competently to them if called upon to do so. 24 Terrell Marshall is a law firm in Seattle, Washington, that focuses on complex 2. 25 civil and commercial litigation with an emphasis on consumer protection, product defect, civil 26 rights, and wage and hour cases. Terrell Marshall has been appointed lead or co-lead counsel 27 DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER IN SUPPORT OF TERREII MARSHAII LAW GROUP PLLC

3.

6

10

8

1112

14

15

13

16

17 18

19 20

2122

2324

25

26

27

throughout the United States. Since its founding in 2008, the attorneys at Terrell Marshall have represented scores of classes, tried class actions in state and federal court, and obtained hundreds of millions of dollars in monetary relief to workers, consumers, and other individuals.

I joined Terrell Marshall in 2014 and became a member in 2018. I practice

representing multi-state and nationwide classes in state and federal court in Washington and

complex litigation with a focus on prosecution of consumer class actions. I have been appointed class counsel in cases challenging a wide range of unfair or deceptive practices, including debt collection practices. In 2010, I received my J.D. from the University of Washington School of Law with high honors, Order of the Coif. I served as Chief Articles Editor for the Washington Law Review. Before joining Terrell Marshall, I served as a law clerk to the Honorable Betty B. Fletcher, Senior United States Circuit Judge for the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals, and to the Honorable John C. Coughenour, Senior United States District Judge for the Western District of Washington. I also served as a judicial extern to the Honorable Robert S. Lasnik, United States District Judge for the Western District of Washington. I co-authored chapters of the Consumer Protection Deskbook published by the Washington State Association for Justice (WSAJ) and have spoken on topics including use of experts and personal jurisdiction in class actions. I am a member of the Public Justice Foundation Board fo Directors, a member of the Washington Employment Lawyers Association (WELA) Amicus Committee, and currently co-chair WSAJ's Consumer Protection Section. I was named to the 2020 Rising Star List by Washington Super Lawyers.

B. Qualifications of other Terrell Marshall attorneys.

4. Beth E. Terrell is a founding member of Terrell Marshall. With over twenty years of experience, Ms. Terrell concentrates her practice in complex litigation, including the prosecution of consumer protection, defective product, and wage and hour class actions. Ms. Terrell has served as co-lead counsel on multi-state, multi-district, and nationwide class actions, resulting in hundreds of millions of dollars in settlements for consumers and workers. Ms.

www.terrellmarshall.com

Terrell also represents individual employees with wage and hour, workplace exposure, and discrimination claims. Ms. Terrell has tried and won cases in state and federal courts and argued before the Washington State Court of Appeals and the Washington State Supreme Court as well as several federal circuit level courts. Ms. Terrell served as the President of the Public Justice Foundation Board of Directors from July 2019 to July 2020, serves on the Equal Justice Works' Board of Counselors, and is Chair of both the Northwest Consumer Law Center and the Washington Employment Lawyers Association. A member of the State Bar of California and the Washington State Bar Association, Ms. Terrell Co-Chairs PLI's Consumer Financial Services Institute, and frequently presents on a wide variety of topics, including class actions, consumer protection, legal ethics, gender equity, and electronic discovery.

- 5. Amanda M. Steiner became a member of Terrell Marshall in 2015. She practices complex litigation, including the prosecution of consumer, defective product, wage and hour, and civil rights class actions. Ms. Steiner received her J.D. from the UC Berkeley School of Law in 1997. Admitted in Washington, California, New York and Hawaii, she has authored briefs that have resulted in numerous favorable decisions for plaintiffs in high-profile and complex securities, antitrust, consumer and civil rights class action in federal and state courts throughout the United States. Ms. Steiner was selected for inclusion in the annual Northern California "Super Lawyers" list and was named to the Top 50 Women Lawyers of Northern California. She is a Fellow of the American Bar Foundation.
- 6. Elizabeth A. Adams joined Terrell Marshall in 2015 and became a member of Terrell Marshall in 2022. Ms. Adams concentrates her practice in complex litigation, including the prosecution of consumer, wage and hour, and civil rights class actions. In 2012, Ms. Adams received her J.D. from the UCLA School of Law, where she received the Order of the Coif and served as a Comments Editor for the UCLA Law Review. Before joining Terrell Marshall, Ms. Adams served as a law clerk to the Honorable Dean D. Pregerson, the Honorable George Wu, and the Honorable John A. Kronstadt, all of the United States District Court for the Central District of California.

2

3

4

5

- 7. Ben Drachler joined Terrell Marshall as an associate in 2017. Mr. Drachler concentrates his practice on complex civil litigation, including the prosecution of consumer, defective product, and wage and hour class actions. Mr. Drachler also litigates complex disputes involving vulnerable adults and trusts and estates. Mr. Drachler received his J.D. from Seattle University, graduating magna cum laude in 2015. Before joining Terrell Marshall, Mr. Drachler served as law clerk to the Honorable Robert H. Whaley in the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Washington, and to the Honorable Thomas S. Zilly in the Western District of Washington.
- 8. Sarah Smith was an associate with Terrell Marshall from 2021 to 2022. Ms. Smith concentrated her practice on complex civil litigation, including the prosecution of consumer and employment class actions. Ms. Smith received her J.D. from the University of Washington, graduating with honors in 2019. Before joining Terrell Marshall, Ms. Smith served as law clerk to the Honorable Stanley A. Bastian in the Eastern District of Washington.

C. Other cases litigated by Terrell Marshall.

- 9. Examples of Fair Debt Collection Practices Act class actions that Terrell Marshall is litigating or has litigated to successful completion include:
 - a. Long v. First Resolution Investment Corp.—Filed in 2018 on behalf of Washington consumers against whom a debt buyer and its collection agency law firm obtained judgments when the debt buyer was not licensed as a collection agency. The King County Superior Court granted final approval of a settlement providing over \$20 million in debt relief and \$600,000 on August 28, 2020.
 - b. Miller v. P.S.C., Inc.—Filed in 2017 on behalf of Washington consumers who alleged P.S.C. filed lawsuits against them using unlawful debt collection forms. The Western District of Washington granted final approval of a settlement that provided injunctive relief and \$1.52 million on January 10, 2020.

- c. Bowen v. CSO Financial, Inc., et al.—Filed in 2017 on behalf of consumers in Washington who received unfair and deceptive debt collection notices that included threats of criminal prosecution. The Western District of Washington granted final approval of a settlement that provided injunctive relief and \$345,000 on July 2018.
- d. *Dibb, et al. v. AllianceOne Receivables Management, Inc.*—Filed in 2014 on behalf of Washington consumers who received unfair and deceptive debt collection notices that included threats of criminal prosecution. The Western District of Washington granted final approval of the \$1.9 million settlement on July 31, 2017.
- e. Solberg, et al. v. Victim Services, Inc., et al.— Filed in 2014 on behalf of California consumers who received false, misleading, and deceptive debt collection letters printed on the letter head of county prosecuting attorneys. The Northern District of California granted final approval of a \$1.1 million settlement on August 19, 2021.
- f. Cavnar, et al. v. BounceBack, Inc.—Filed in 2014 on behalf of Washington consumers who received false, misleading, and deceptive debt collection letters printed on the letterhead of county prosecuting attorneys. The Eastern District of Washington granted final approval of the \$530,000 settlement on September 15, 2016.
- 10. Additional information about class actions litigated by Terrell Marshall is available on our website www.terrellmarshall.com.

D. The prosecution of this action.

- 11. Both parties took written discovery and depositions. Attached hereto as <u>Exhibit</u>

 <u>A</u> are true and correct copies of the orders cited in Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Service Awards.
- 12. IQ Data sought interlocutory review of the Court's orders denying its motions to disqualify the Class Representatives in Division I of the Washington Court of Appeals and the parties fully briefed IQ Data's motion for discretionary review.

12

13 14

15

16

1718

19

20

2122

23

2425

2627

- 13. IQ Data then removed this case to federal court under the Class Action Fairness

 Act. The federal court issued an order remanding the case to this Court on October 5, 2022, but

 IQ appealed that order. The parties had fully briefed the appeal in the Ninth Circuit Court of

 Appeals and were just a week away from oral argument when the case settled.
- 14. While the federal court proceedings moved forward, the Commissioner for Division I also held a hearing IQ Data's motion for discretionary review, but deferred ruling until the federal proceedings were complete. IQ Data only dismissed the state appeal after this Court granted preliminary approval of the settlement.
- 15. The parties participated in three full-day mediations before the case settled. They mediated with the Honorable John Erlick in March 2022, they participated in a full day mediation with Ninth Circuit Mediator Robert Kaiser in January 2023, and ultimately agreed on the settlement amount at the end of a full day mediation with the Honorable Paris Kallas (Ret.) in June 2023. The parties then negotiated the final terms of the Settlement Agreement through direct arm's length negotiations.
- 16. Attached hereto as <u>Exhibit B</u> is the Order Granting Plaintiff's Unopposed Motion for Final Approval of Class Action Settlement and Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs and Service Award in *Strong v. Numerica Credit Union*, No. 17-2-01406-39 (Yakima Cnty. Sup. Ct. Feb. 14, 2020) (awarding one-third of fund)).
- 17. Attached hereto as <u>Exhibit C</u> is the Final Approval Order and Entry of Judgment in *Dougherty v. Barrett Business Servs., Inc.*, No. 17-2-05619-1 (Clark Cnty. Sup. Ct. Nov. 8, 2019) (awarding one-third of fund)).
- 18. Attached hereto as <u>Exhibit D</u> is the Order Approving Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs in *Terrell v. Costco Wholesale Corp.*, No. 16-2-19140-1 SEA (King Cnty. Sup. Ct. June 19, 2018) (awarding one-third of fund).
- 19. Terrell Marshall has advanced significant costs for and invested more than a thousand hours into the investigation and prosecution of this case. We will continue to commit

www.terrellmarshall.com

the time and resources necessary to litigate the case and fairly and adequately represent and protect the interests of the Classes.

- 20. Since the beginning of this case, Terrell Marshall has worked with no guarantee of being compensated for its time and efforts. Payment of Terrell Marshall's fees has always been contingent on successfully obtaining relief for the plaintiffs and the class members. As a result, there was a substantial risk of non-payment, particularly in light of the challenges inherent in this type of case. Work on this case has necessarily been to the exclusion of work on other matters that likely would have generated fees. Terrell Marshall has also been denied use of the fees it earned over the course of this case.
- 21. The work performed by paralegals and legal assistants was work that I or an attorney would have had to perform absent such assistance. All of our staff members are qualified to perform substantive legal work based on their training and past experience working for attorneys.
- 22. The following table identifies the attorneys and staff members from Terrell Marshall who worked on this case and for whom the recovery of fees is sought. For each of the timekeepers below I have stated the current hourly rate, the number of hours worked through November 28, 2023, and the total amount of fees. These time summaries are taken from contemporaneous, daily time reports prepared and maintained by Terrell Marshall in the regular course of business. All Terrell Marshall attorneys track their time in six minute increments.

NAME AND POSITION	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERFORMED	RATE	HOURS BILLED	TOTAL
	ATTORNEYS			
Beth E. Terrell	Managed discovery matters including	\$600	64.1	\$38,460.00
Founding Member	plaintiffs' responses to second sets of			
J.D. from Univ. of	discovery; meetings and email			
California, Davis	communications with co-counsel			
School of Law, 1995	regarding case management and			
	strategy; drafted and revised motions			

1	NAME AND	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERFORMED	RATE	HOURS	TOTAL
2	POSITION	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERIORIVED	MAIL	BILLED	IOIAL
		relating to discovery; wrote and			
3		responded to voluminous discovery correspondence; defended client			
4		Omar's deposition and prepared for			
5		same; argued discovery motions; and participated in mediations.			
6	Toby J. Marshall Founding Member		\$575	.4	\$230.00
7	J.D. from Univ. of				
8	Washington School				
9	of Law, 2002 Jennifer Rust	Reviewed and edited motions; worked	\$575	6.2	\$3,565.00
10	Murray	on client deposition preparation.	ر <i>ا</i> رد	0.2	Ş3,303.00
	Founding Member				
11	J.D. from Univ. of Washington School				
12	of Law, 2005				
13	Amanda Steiner	Primary drafter of class certification	\$575	77.6	\$44,620.00
14	Member J.D. from UC	briefing; drafted motion for leave to amend and mediation submissions.			
15	Berkeley School of				
	Law, 1997		Ć 40E	F0F 0	¢200 020 F0
16	Blythe D. Chandler Member	Lead counsel for case; legal research; drafted and revised pleadings, motions,	\$495	585.9	\$290,020.50
17	J.D. from Univ. of	mediation submissions, discovery			
18	Washington School of Law, 2010	requests, appellate briefs, and deposition notices; argued motions to			
19	OI Law, 2010	disqualify class representatives and			
20		appellate motion and prepared for same; participated in client depositions			
21		and meetings to prepare clients for			
22		deposition; reviewed documents to			
		identify exhibits for motions and depositions; participated in all			
23		mediations; meetings and email			
24		communications with co-counsel			
25		regarding case management and strategy; wrote and responded to			
26		voluminous discovery correspondence;			
		took deposed IQ Data corporate			
27		designee, for collector, and training			

1 2	NAME AND POSITION	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERFORMED	RATE	HOURS BILLED	TOTAL
		manger; participated in numerous			
3		discovery conferences with defense			
4		counsel; drafted settlement agreement and class notice documents.			
5	Elizabeth A. Adams Member	Primary author of briefs pertaining to quashing subpoenas for client	\$425	159.2	\$67,660.00
6	J.D. from UCLA	employment records, motions to			
7	School of Law, 2012	disqualify clients as class representatives, response to motion			
8		for reconsideration, and motion for			
9		protective order filed in federal court; legal research related to briefing			
10		projects; worked on discovery matters relating to defendants' net worth and			
11		potential expert work; participated in numerous discovery conferences			
12		relating to same; managed client			
13		communications related to some discovery disputes; meetings and email			
14		communications with co-counsel			
15		regarding case management and strategy.			
16	Ben Drachler Associate	Worked on case management and revision of briefing.	\$375	.8	\$285.00
17	J.D. from Seattle	revision of briefing.			
18	Univ. School of Law, 2015				
19	Eden Nordby Associate	Worked on class notices and briefing relating to approval of same;	\$325	14.9	\$4,842.50
20	J.D. from Univ. of	participated in discovery conference			
21	Washington School of Law, 2021	relating to net worth information and drafted motion to compel production			
22	,	of same.			
23	Brittany Glass Associate	Worked on pleadings and discovery matters.	\$325	15.8	\$5,135.00
24	J.D. from Univ. of Texas School of				
25	Law, 2014				
26	Maria Hoisington- Bingham	Drafted stipulated motions relating to amendment of pleadings.	\$325	4.1	\$1,332.50
27	Associate				

DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS AND SERVICE AWARDS - 9 CASE NO. 20-2-07084-0 SEA

NAME AND POSITION	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERFORMED	RATE	HOURS BILLED	TOTAL
J.D. from Univ. of				
Washington School				
of Law, 2016	Duine and due from a foliant a bioction and	¢22F	202.4	¢cc 405 00
Sarah Smith Associate	Primary drafter of client objections and responses to voluminous discovery	\$325	203.4	\$66,105.00
J.D. from Univ. of	requests; correspondence and			
Washington School	conferences relating to same;			
of Law, 2019	conducted legal research relating to			
	numerous discovery disputes; meetings			
	and email communications with co-			
	counsel regarding case management			
	and strategy; worked with experts on			
	net worth calculation; legal research			
	related to net worth valuation under			
	the FDCPA; drafted discovery motions.			
Charity Chen	Performed legal research.	\$250	.7	\$175
Summer Law Clerk				
	PARALEGALS/LEGAL ASSISTANTS	S		
Jennifer Boschen	Assisted with Court filings and	\$195	3.7	\$651.50
Senior Paralegal	deposition preparation.			
22 years legal				
experience				
Jodi Nuss	Assisted with Court filings, assisted	\$195	52.3	\$10,048.50
Senior Paralegal	with deposition preparation, drafted			
9 years legal	and processed subpoenas, processed			
experience	document productions, and performed data analysis.			
Heather Brown	Processed document productions and	\$150	34.6	\$5,190.00
Paralegal	assisted with Court filings.	1200	34.0	ÇD,190.00
20 years legal	dissisted with court mings.			
experience				
Holly Rota	Worked on creating pleadings,	\$150	16.6	\$2,177.50
Legal Assistant	maintaining the case file, processing			. , , , , ,
18 years legal	subpoenas, and filing documents with			
experience	the Court.			
Krystal Brown	Worked on filing documents with the	\$150	.5	\$75.00
Legal Assistant	Court.			
13 Years legal				
experience	1	I		

DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS AND SERVICE AWARDS - 10 CASE NO. 20-2-07084-0 SEA

1	NAME AND POSITION	DESCRIPTION OF WORK PERFORMED	RATE	HOURS BILLED	TOTAL
2	Jessica Langsted	Worked on docketing case deadlines,	\$150	56.3	\$8,445.00
3	Legal Assistant	assisted with Court filings, assisted with			
4	6 years legal	deposition preparation, drafted and			
4	experience	processed subpoenas, processed			
5		document productions.			
6	Lauren Carter	Worked on document production and	\$125	2.5	\$312.50
0	Legal Assistant	securing translator services.			
7	2 years legal experience				
8	Chantal Montanez	Performed case research and assisted	\$125	3.0	\$375.00
0	Legal Assistant	with hearing preparation.	7123	3.0	\$373.00
9	2 years legal	With fieding preparation.			
10	experience				
10	Tanya Stewart	Worked on creating pleadings,	\$125	9.7	\$1,212.50
11	Legal Assistant	maintaining the case file, and filing			
12	8 years legal	documents with the Court.			
12	experience				
13	Ana Amezaga	Worked on creating pleadings,	\$125	115.50	\$14,437.50
14	Legal Assistant	maintaining the case file, and filing			
17	2 years legal	documents with the Court.			
15	experience	Assistant with latter and subjects	Ċ1F0	1.0	¢150.00
16	Jennifer Murphy Legal Assistant	Assisted with letter and exhibits to circuit court mediator.	\$150	1.0	\$150.00
10	4 years legal	circuit court mediator.			
17	experience				
18	Eva Thomas	Worked on docketing case deadlines,	\$125	27.8	\$3,475.00
10	Legal Assistant	performed case research, processed	, -		1-,
19	4 years legal	public records requests, and assisted			
20	experience	with hearing preparation.			
20	Hannah Kern	Arranged interpretation services for	\$125	4	\$500.00
21	Legal Assistant	deposition.			
22	1 year of legal				
	experience		4.0-		40-000
23	Daniel Lee	Worked on docketing case deadlines.	\$125	2	\$250.00
24	Legal Assistant 1 year legal				
	experience				
25	TOTAL:			1462.6	\$569,730.50
26	L				. ,

DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS AND SERVICE AWARDS - 11 CASE NO. 20-2-07084-0 SEA

- 23. I anticipate the firm will incur additional fees in relation to the approval and settlement administration process.
- 24. Terrell Marshall sets rates for attorneys and staff members based on a variety of factors, including among others: the experience, skill and sophistication required for the types of legal services typically performed; the rates customarily charged in the markets where legal services are typically performed; and the experience, reputation and ability of the attorneys and staff members.
- 25. Terrell Marshall has incurred out-of-pocket litigation expenses totaling \$47,939.77, primarily to cover expenses related to translation services, court reporting, legal research, filing fees, mediation fees, and administrative costs such as copying, mailing, and messenger expenses. The following chart summarizes Terrell Marshall's litigation costs:

Category of Expense	Total
Copies (outside)	\$379.45
Courier/Process Server	\$1,108.61
Court Reporter	\$5,757.50
FedEx	\$47.83
Filing Fees	\$1,152.21
Investigator	\$1,385.00
Meals	\$34.65
Mediation Fees	\$6,920.00
PACER	\$4.20
Parking	\$13.00
Professional Fees	\$2,020.00
Records Requests	\$13.25

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Category of Expense	Total
Transcripts	\$13,553.38
Translator Services	\$15,101.77
Westlaw	\$448.92
TOTAL	\$47,939.77

I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the State of Washington and the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

EXECUTED at Seattle, Washington and dated this 6th day of December, 2023.

By: <u>/s/ Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387</u> Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387

1	DECLARATION OF SERVICE				
2	I, Blythe H. Chandler, hereby certify that on December 6, 2023, I caused true and correct				
3	copies of the foregoing to be served via the means indicated below:				
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Christopher E. Hawk, WSBA #43307 Email: chawk@grsm.com Katherine L. Saint Germain, WSBA #46447 Email: ksaintgermain@grsm.com Petra N. Ambrose, WSBA #48924 Email: pambrose@grsm.com Amy P. Taylor, WSBA #53644 Email: ataylor@grsm.com Mark B. Tuvim, WSBA #31909 Email: mtuvim@grsm.com GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP 701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2100 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (503) 227-8269 Facsimile: (503) 616-3600				
14 15 16 17 18	Sean P. Flynn, Admitted Pro Hac Vice Email: sflynn@grsm.com GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP 201 West Liberty Street, Suite 320 Reno, Nevada 89501 Telephone: (702) 577-9317 Attorneys for Defendant I.Q. Data International, Inc. U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Hand Delivered via Messenger Service Overnight Courier Facsimile Electronic Mail Via the King County Electronic Filing Notification System				
220 221 222 223 224 225 226	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington and the United States that the foregoing is true and correct. DATED this 6th day of December, 2023. By: /s/ Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387 Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387				
	DECLARATION OF BLYTHE H. CHANDLER IN SUPPORT OF				